Wildlife Conservation Depends on Human Behaviour Change of Users, Conservationists, Donors

How advertising agencies can help

Dr. Lynn Johnson
Founder, Breaking The Brand Project
Managing Director, Leadership Mastery Pty Ltd
In all the tragic events BTB has seen regarding rhino poaching, the photograph of this little calf has been one of the most heart wrenching. The story behind the photograph is:

In May 2011 a female rhino was driven over a cliff by a group of poachers using a pack of dogs; her horn was then chopped off and the rhino was partially butchered.

It must have taken the little calf some time (more than a day) to get to its mother at the bottom of the cliff, where it lay next to her until an anti-poaching unit found them both.

We don’t know what happened to the calf, but this photograph keeps us driven.
Why did the market for rhino horn change?

- Low levels of poaching in South Africa for over 15 years
- In 1993 China’s GDP enters period of steep growth
- In 2003 Viet Nam enters period of steep growth
- What happened since 2007?
- TRAFFIC 2012 Report and other research indicates rhino poaching driven by exponential growth in demand primarily from Viet Nam
The Value of Wildlife Crime

- Wildlife crime is the 4th largest transnational crime in the world
- In 2011 it was estimated to be worth US$17 billion
- High-value ‘products’ – rhino horn: ~US$65,000/kg

- Traffickers moving from exploiting interest to manufacturing interest
- This is not BAU, a new strategy is needed
Return On Investment

Security measures are recurring, huge expenses (vast land areas to protect). Complex supply chain and high value of ‘product’ mean law enforcement expensive and corruption limits effectiveness

Consumption motivation and pattern means demand reduction is possible. Small customer group, clear motivation for use.
Great Examples of Behaviour Change Campaigns

It takes up to 40 dumb animals to make a fur coat. But only one to wear it.

If you don't want millions of animals tortured and killed in leg-hold traps, don't buy a fur coat.

Rich bitch. Poor bitch.

If you don't want millions of animals tortured and killed in leg-hold traps, don't buy a fur coat.

Figure 2. "A Bird of Prey", Punch, 14th May 1892.
The Market Context and The Customers

- 70% of the population of Vietnam is under 35 years.
- Fast growing market for luxury goods and brands.
- Aspirational and status conscious.
- High inequality, small percentage of extremely wealthy.
- Rhino horn is status symbol.
- >90% of rhino horn purchased is fake.
- Rising prices turn rhino horn into an investment /store of value – causing China to re-enter the market.
High Status Males

- Senior Businessmen/Finance Professionals/Government Officials.
- Group values rarity and expense rather than perceived medical properties.
- Acquiring rare produce associated with money, power and skill.
- Rhino horn gift used to demonstrate respect and competence when negotiating deals.
- Gifts used to influence and obtain preferential treatment from those in positions of power.
- Historically people have developed an interdependent self-concept vs. independent self-concept and, as a result, you can’t put personal preferences before group objective – loss of face - peer group pressure

Primary User 1

Only 2 motivators to stop using:

- Negative impact on personal status as a result of using/giving rhino horn.
- Negative impact on health from using rhino horn.

“I would be happy to buy the last rhino horn.” Statement from one of the users I interviewed. Price is not a problem.

“I trust my South African Supply Chain”
Primary User 2

Primary motivator to stop using:

- Negative impact on family health from using rhino horn.

“If my aging parent or parent-in-law asks me to buy rhino horn for them, culturally I can’t say no even if I don’t believe in it.”

“Being able to tell them that the horn is poisoned is the only way I feel I can push back on the request”

Affluent Women

- Believe in fever-reducing qualities of rhino horn - in line with use in Chinese/Vietnamese medicine.
- Keep small quantities at home in case child gets a high fever.
- Also buy for aging parents.
- Relatively recent trend.
- Unclear if using fake vs. genuine rhino horn.
- A group heavily influenced by social media.
- Small individual quantities but large group size.
- Interested and aspire to celebrity mothers.
- Again very status conscious and aspirational.
Influencing Consumption

- Private sector has accumulated massive expertise in influencing consumption – marketing, advertising, social psychology, behavioural economics, neuroscience
- Applies to all goods from fast food to luxury cars

Key strategies that apply to rhino horn are:

1. Status Anxiety (peer pressure, keeping up, power)
2. Fear of death/loss of loved one (miracle cancer cure)
3. Personal health anxiety (chi, detox drink)
4. Loss Aversion (investment, store of value)
Analysis: Future Trends

Luxury labels invest millions dollars to monitor customer evolution e.g. ostentatious evolving to more understated trend.
Analysis: Emerging Markets

- Traditional market research (see image)
- In addition - archetype research uses a unique blend of biology, cultural anthropology and psychology to discover the hidden cultural forces that pre-organize the way people behave toward a product, service or concept.
- Unlocks unconscious structures that hold the key to all of our decision-making processes.

Generation Luxe: The new luxury consumers

China
Male, 27
Lives in Shanghai
Favourite brands: Zegna, Dunhill, Ferragamo

Holidays in: Hong Kong, France, Australia
Profession: Corporate executive for a global company
Earnings: $75,000

When he's not working he's ... playing golf (at the Grand Shanghai International Golf & Country Club)

Within three years a fifth of all luxury goods will be bought by Chinese consumers, already Louis Vuitton has more stores in China than in France and Italy combined. Meet the new big shot in luxury consumption.

Young, successful and optimistic, the Chinese luxury connoisseur wasn't even born when Deng Xiaoping began opening up China to global markets, kick-starting three decades of growth. They're sophisticated, live for the moment and are becoming more comfortable treating themselves and showing off their wealth.

Not that all Chinese luxury consumers have cash to burn. According to Yurok Atsumo from McKinsey's Shanghai office, many in China's aspirational middle class will save up to buy luxury items, spending up to 45% of their income. "It's not uncommon to hear stories of people who buy RMB1 million ($150,000) cars and sleep on the floor of their office".

Researching and understanding the local culture is essential to gaining a foothold in the luxury market (most international brands now have Chinese-specific product lines) as is embracing the Internet. McKinsey's research showed that, apart from the store itself, the web is by far the most influential marketing medium.
Why do they think rhino horn = status???

- Globally many people say they can’t relate to the motivation to consume ‘ground up finger nails’
- Are we so different?
- Why do people believe a Louis Vuitton handbag = status???
  - Fake bag = $200
  - Real bag = $2,000+
- Same bag! Same material!
- Difference: STATUS SYMBOL
- Status symbols are a social agreement, which can be changed as values or even tastes evolve

Can YOU tell the difference?
World’s Most Expensive Dessert US$35,000
Using Behaviour Change Models

- Social Marketing and social psychology have developed numerous models of human behaviour change (influencing/manipulation)
- Most conservation agencies remain unaware of these models and go ‘with their gut feeling’
- Most conservation agencies are more concerned about their donors’ responses than campaign effectiveness
- Most ‘measurements’ performed do not measure demand (reduction)
The Triune Brain Model

- The way we rationalize our decisions does not reflect how we make them - the reptilian brain is a much more powerful influence.

- Neocortex mostly just rationalises decisions made by the reptilian and limbic system.

- Because these drivers remain unconscious, they can be skilfully exploited in marketing and advertising.

Status Anxiety / Loss Aversion – **Limbic**
Fear of Death / Health Anxiety – **Reptilian**
Spiral Dynamics – Values and Behaviour Change Model

| Colour | Stage  | Values                                                                 |
|--------|--------|                                                                      |
| Turquoise | Holistic | Collective individualism; Cosmic Spirituality; Earth Changes       |
| Yellow | Integral | Natural Systems; Self-principle; Multiple Realities; Knowledge       |
| Green  | Consensus | Egalitarian; Feelings; Sharing; Caring; Community                   |
| Orange | Strategic | Materialistic; Consumerism; Success; Image; Status; Growth; Winners and Losers |
| Blue   | Authority | Meaning; Discipline; Traditions; Morality; Rules; Live for Later, Saints and Sinners |
| Red    | Egocentric | Gratification; Glitz; Conquest; Action; Impulsive; Lives for Now, Heroes and Victims |
| Purple | Animistic | Rites; Rituals; Taboos; Superstitions; Tribes; Folk Ways and Lore    |
| Beige  | Instinctive | Food; Water; Procreation; Warmth; Protection; Stay Alive          |

Australia:
~25% GREEN
~45% ORANGE
~20% BLUE

Viet Nam:
Dominantly Blue
Emerging Orange Middle Class
Example 1 – Effects of Unemployment

- When someone who has reached GREEN or ORANGE becomes unemployed, they usually regress to RED within 6 months.
- The lack of routine and the isolation means that an egocentric values system (RED) is re-activated as there is no longer any use for the higher values.
- When such a person re-enters the workplace after long-term unemployment, they usually cannot go back to ORANGE or GREEN straight away.
- In the first instance they are looking for security after the extended insecurity of RED and unemployment – that means they are looking for BLUE.
- Programs helping the long-term unemployed need to offer a BLUE environment (safe with clear structure and rules).
Example 2 – Corporate Social Responsibility

- Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) was an attempt to bolt **GREEN** onto the embodiment of pure **ORANGE** - the transnational corporation under neoliberal capitalism.
- It reflected the response to concerns from **GREEN** groups and subsets of the customer base with **GREEN** values to the externalisation of operating costs onto the environment.
- When the financial crisis hit in 2008 two things happened – most people previously operating from **GREEN** went back to **ORANGE** because their livelihood was under threat AND corporations stopped the **GREENwashing** of their brand and dropped CSR.
- CSR was NEVER going to work, **GREEN** concerns and values are FUNDAMENTALLY incompatible with **ORANGE**.
Rhino Horn Users (ORANGE)

- Status Conscious and Status Anxiety
- Health Conscious and Health Anxiety
- Society in Viet Nam is in transition Confucian/Communist to Unregulated Capitalist
- Still different from Western Capitalism
  - Male dominated
  - Peer group oriented, not purely individualistic, can’t lose face by standing against group
  - No/little cultural affinity with animals

Result:
- Conservation messages are ignored if they are empathy/values based
- Law enforcement messages are largely ignored (75% fully aware of penalties)
- Can’t go via wives/children – lack status to influence husband/parents
- Influencers - Only Business/Political heavyweights (Bill Gates, Warren Buffet, Richard Branson, Bill Clinton – not entertainment/sports celebrities)
Conservation Movement (GREEN)

• Based on GREEN values system (Empathy, Egalitarian, Caring)
• Support base is GREEN
• Donors are GREEN and donations are based on GREEN values
• Hence:
  • Focus is on empathy with the animal
  • Appeal to ‘higher’ (GREEN) values

• Can’t relate to motivation of users (ORANGE) or poachers (RED, Beige)
• Not prepared to single out the primary users for fear of being seen as racist
• Not prepared to engage in strategies that may alienate (cause discomfort in) the support and donor base. Political Correctness emerged with GREEN

• Result:
  • Money spent on strategies that don’t impact or change the user behaviour
Conservation Sector Has Been Comfortable With Awareness Raising

**Appeal to Empathy**

*Would you want your child to grow up as an orphan? A rhino mother would not! Say no to rhino horn.*

**Rational Argument**

*Rhino horn is made of the same stuff as human nails. Still want some?*

**Appeal to Higher Values**

None of these strategies
- Get the user’s attention
- Trigger an immediate emotional response in the user
Behaviour Change Messages

• Get the target’s attention by providing a link to their identity (‘this is about people like me’)  
• Create an instant emotional response in the recipient  
• Negative emotions are experienced 3-4 stronger than positive emotions  
• FUD – Fear, Uncertainty, Doubt (Status anxiety, health anxiety)
Health Anxiety – Rhino Horn Infusion

- Pharmaceutical industry research - once there is a 1 in 7 chance of a negative reaction to health supplement or medication users stop taking it
- Infuse 15% of SA rhinos

Pro-trade lobby undermined this method as it is the only technique that devalues the horn from a user perspective.
The rhino horn you give to a potential business partner will not only kill a magnificent animal, it’s quite possible it will poison him.

In both Africa and Asia they are serious about protecting rhinoceroses from extinction. So the horns are being injected with toxins such as organophosphates while on the live animal.

The poachers know this. If they illegally kill the animal and sell the horns to dealers in Vietnam, they know they will poison anybody who consumes it.

The only way you will know if you have poisoned someone you want to impress with rhino horn is when they call the next day to say they have become very sick with nausea and diarrhoea.

It’s not worth ruining a business relationship with poisoned rhino horns.

BTB Pilot Campaign (Sep 2014): Is it worth the risk?

Series of 6 adverts – 3 targets:

- **Businessmen**: Tarnish the act of giving rhino horn by making the giver and the act look desperate and needy.

- **Businessmen and Mothers**: Instil fear and doubt about the possible risk to their own or child’s health.

- **International Corporations**: To raise fear of reputational risk of staff caught receiving rhino horn as gift.

Cost/Locations:

- 19 adverts over 2 months in business, women's magazines and two months in Heritage, Vietnamese Airline magazine.

- Commercial rates US$30,000

Advert uses:

- **Rhino horn infusion**:

  Organophosphates: neurotoxin immediate impact nausea and diarrhoea, long term effects central nervous system, effects brain development, long-term low dosage cognitive problems.

- Poachers know but don’t care.
BTB Lunar New Year (Jan2015): Will your luck run out?

Series of 4 adverts – 3 targets:

- **Businessmen**: Tarnish the act of giving rhino horn to business network for LNY.

- **Businessmen and Mothers**: Instil fear and doubt about the possible risk to their own or child’s health.

Advert uses:

- **Superstition around LNY**

- **Rhino horn infusion**:

- **Organophosphates (neurotoxin - central nervous system, brain development, cognitive problems)**

- **Ectoparasiticides (linked to increased risk of certain cancers) and radioactive tracers**

- **Poachers know but don’t care**

- **Users can’t dissociate themselves from human toll**

Cost/Locations:

- 11 adverts over 5 weeks, leading up to LNY 19th February 2015, in business, women's magazines and one month in Heritage, Vietnamese Airline magazine.

- Commercial rates US$25,000

More and more world leaders say that the survival of Africa’s wildlife is intimately linked to its people’s prosperity. The slaughtering of rhinos to feed businessmen’s egos taxes away valuable tourism dollars from local communities who depend on them.

But ruthless poachers don’t just kill rhinos to fulfill your desire for horn. Every week they also kill two or more rangers who are working to protect these animals. The rangers’ wives become widows, their children fatherless; families lose their income and their children’s education is disrupted.

Furthermore, you could be poisoning yourself and those you give it to. Horns are being infused with toxins that will cause suffering to anybody who consumes it.

By using rhino horn you are taking away the livelihoods of families in Africa; you may be unlucky enough to negatively impact your own.

The rhino horn you give to sick, ageing parents or as a health supplement for your children could poison them.

In both Africa and Asia they are seriously about protecting rhinoceroses from extinction so their horns are being infused with toxins while on the live animal.

It doesn’t affect the animal, but will bring pain and suffering to anybody who consumes rhino horn. Organophosphates are neurotoxins that will cause nausea and diarrhoea; ectoparasiticides can increase the risk of certain cancers; some horn is also infused with radioactive tracers.

So if you wish to bring good health to your family for the coming year, rhino horn is not the way to do it.
BTB (Jan2016): What does a wildlife criminal look like?

2 adverts – 3 targets:

• **Businessmen:** - Tarnish the act of giving rhino horn to business network for LNY.

• **Businessmen:** - Can you really trust them to do business with?

• **International Corporations:** Beware of reputational risk of doing business of staff caught receiving rhino horn as gift.

Advert uses:

• Vietnam increasingly globalized, signatory to TPP

• More exposure to international business and business leaders, greater scrutiny

• Superstition around LNY

• Users can’t dissociate themselves from their criminal behaviour

Cost/Locations:

• 18 adverts over 15 weeks and 2xeditorial in the lead up to LNY 8th February 2016 and beyond, in business, lifestyle (golf) and women's magazines.

• Commercial rates US$25,000
Editorial in Vietnam Investment Review

- Vietnam Investment Review, a weekly English language magazine
- Targeted at business leaders, economists and senior government officials in Vietnam
- Circulation 40,000
Summary

• $80,000 was spent producing/publishing adverts, Vietnamese media.

• Commercial rates had to be paid in all publications.

• Several full-page adverts Heritage Magazine, the inflight magazine of Vietnam Airlines. Vietnam Airlines has about 300 daily flights.

• We know that by placing an advert in these magazines we are targeting some of Viet Nam’s wealthiest citizens and the demographic group that can afford to buy genuine rhino horn.

• Have raised $80,000 for next campaign – new images, focus on status anxiety and ‘wildlife criminal’ angle. Launch date July 2016.
Initial Campaign Response

One important experience

In a conversation with one businessman in Hanoi he told me about a friend whose child has cancer. She had bought rhino horn. This businessman had seen the adverts and told her about them. The fear of giving her child poisoned rhino horn meant that when she finished using the piece she had she said she wouldn’t buy any more.

- Great feedback from Viet Nam in relation to messaging, images and approach
- Viet Nam jumps to third top country downloading information from our website
- Ho Chi Minh City and Hanoi become second and third cities following us on Facebook
- In TV and newspaper interviews, questions focus on rhino horn poisoning and wanting to know more
- WildAct Vietnam followed up with related campaign and TV interview
- No quantitative research due to lack of funds
Letter/Pack to Businessmen in Viet Nam

Timing:
1. Trans Pacific-Partnership
2. Panama Papers
3. Unaoil
Behaviour Change is Highly Targeted

**Basic Test to Differentiate Demand Reduction from Awareness Raising and Education**

- **Awareness Raising**: The campaign targets a broad, general population to make them (more) conscious about the (scale of the) problem.
- **Education**: Educates segments of population who don’t currently use rhino horn e.g. children, students or educates general population to highlight limiting belief e.g. like finger nails, no medical benefits.
- **Educates**: groups that can influence the current users of rhino horn to stop e.g. government officials, traditional Chinese medicine practitioners, police, doctors, judiciary etc.
- **Educates**: user demographic group (who may or may not be using rhino horn) in a way that encourages them not to start using or discourages them from starting to use rhino horn.
- **Elicits**: emotional response in user demographic group in a way they will challenge/reject the people they know who are using rhino horn (move to action).
- **Elicits**: emotional response in the current users groups such that they become conscious about the implications of and opposition to their use of rhino horn.
- **Elicits**: emotional response in the current users groups to such a level that it triggers them to stop using rhino horn in a time frame that is useful to save the rhino from extinction in the wild.

DR = Demand Reduction
Awareness Raising Campaigns— Estimated Spend US $10 Million
Education Campaigns—Estimated Spend Less than US$5 Million
Campaigns Challenging Beliefs Current Users—Estimated Spend Less than US$1.5 Million
Campaigns That Have The Potential To Trigger Behaviour Change

Spend less than US$70,000
Accepting Discomfort

Conservation sector needs to evolve to accept discomfort in creating and publishing campaigns that target the users and have negative messages.
Using Anxiety Works - Tobacco

Health Anxiety

What Can We Learn From 40 Years of Anti-Smoking Adverts/Campaigns

Anti-smoking adverts have an excellent track record of achieving demand reduction for a substance that is addictive and used to have a high (glamorous) status in society.

- Research consistently shows that messages that evoke high negative emotion regarding the health effects of smoking are more effective than messages that are typically less emotionally evocative.
  - In the 7 new studies (reported in 8 papers) in which adult smokers rated a range of ads, negative health effects ads were perceived to be most effective.
  - These messages have been found to work in exactly the same way in Asia as they do in the West.
- Anti-industry messages have shown success though there has been limited use of these types of ads.

Get the right level of campaign frequency or intensity while campaigns are on air is also crucial for optimizing campaign investment.

- Studies suggest an average of at least 1200 Target Audience Ratings Points (TARPs) per quarter, or exposure of the entire adult population to around 12 anti-smoking ads over 3 months is needed to change adult smoking behaviour.

Greater effects are observed as the intensity increases - probability of quitting and staying quit after about 1 year was 41% when not exposed to any anti-smoking ads, 52% when exposed to approximately 1100 TARPs per quarter, and 74% when exposed to over 3500 TARPs per quarter, after holding other potentially influential factors constant.

- Emotionally intense (negative) messages require fewer TARPs to be recalled than those lower in emotional intensity. More cost effective and greater ROI.
- Alluring intensely negative ads motivated more smokers to call Quitlines who were less ready to quit or who had lower confidence in quitting.
- How-to-quit, positive or humorous ads were least likely to be perceived effective for motivating quitting.

Quote from paper

“In sum, the most recent studies are consistent with the findings of recent past reviews that there is strong evidence for the use of highly evocative negative health effects messages to motivate changes in adult smoking behaviour and to reduce smoking initiation in adolescents.”

Quote from one of the world’s most accomplished researchers on anti-smoking campaigns

“Negative messaging campaigns do the grunt work. Positive messaging campaigns make them palatable for the governments to fund.”

Status Anxiety
Results Can Happen Quickly

SeaWorld sees profits plunge 84% as customers desert controversial park

Company reports decline in attendance, sales and profits in continuing struggles for park since 2013 film Blackfish claimed it mistreated orca whales.

SeaWorld has suffered a 84% collapse in profits as customers have deserted the controversial aquatic theme park company following claims it mistreated orca whales.

The company, which trains dolphins and killer whales to perform tricks in front of stadiums full of spectators, on Thursday reported declines in attendance, sales and profits because of “continued brand challenges”.

From the launch of Blackfish in July 2013, this profit plunge took just two years.
Collaborating With Social Science

- Conservation is about people’s behaviour, not animals
- Interest in wildlife ‘products’ is a cultural/human behaviour issue
- Conservation science is still too wedded to biology, ecology
- We can only win the war on wildlife trafficking through collaboration with social sciences
- Cultural anthropology, social marketing, behavioural economics, social psychology

“Sales tricks are what you use to sell something to someone who doesn’t even know they want it.” — Steve Jobs

Let's use these same strategies to stop people buying wildlife ‘products’.
Summary

- Exponential demand growth makes it impossible to win on the supply side (including trade legalization).
- Demand reduction can work with the right messaging and targeting (and is MUCH CHEAPER).
- Conservation agencies need to create true demand reduction/ behaviour change campaigns targeting the users.
- Conservation agencies distinguish between demand reduction vs. education vs. awareness raising.
- Create a tighter definition of what constitutes demand reduction.
- Educate conservation, activists and donors that it is not about creating campaigns for them – they may find adverts that work ‘distasteful’.
- Advertising agencies can help in this approach.

www.breakingthebrand.org
Example closer to home: Palm oil advert Ideas

Another ‘inconvenient truth’ - As unconscious consumers we are pillaging the natural world